IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS HOUSTON DIVISON

§	
§	
§	CIVIL ACTION
§	
§	No. 19-CV-2236
§	
§	
§	
§	
§	
§	
§	
§	

DEFENDANTS CITY OF HOUSTON'S AND ANNA RUSSELL'S MOTION TO DISMISS OR, ALTERNATIVELY, FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Defendants, the City of Houston ("Houston"), and Anna Russell, ¹the former City Secretary sued in her official capacity, (collectively "the City"), file this Motion to Dismiss or, Alternatively, Motion for Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' claims, pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1) and 56. In support of its alternative Motions, the City states the following:

This Court should dismiss and/or grant summary judgment and enter a take-nothing judgment in the City's favor because Plaintiffs' claims seeking declaratory and injunctive relief are moot. Plaintiffs' nominal damages claim should also be dismissed. First, Plaintiffs have no standing to assert a nominal damages claim. Plaintiffs admit that nominal

1

¹ Ms. Russell is deceased.

damages will not redress their alleged injuries. Moreover, the Supreme Court has recently held that nominal damages satisfy redressability requirements only when there is actual enforcement of the challenged law, which all parties concede did not occur here. Alternatively, nominal damages become moot when actual declarative claims become moot, as they have here, because they cannot redress any alleged injury.

These arguments is set forth in detail in Defendants' Memorandum in Support of its Motion to Dismiss or, Alternatively, Motion for Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' Claims, which is incorporated for all purposes here, and which will be filed concurrently with this document.

For the reasons stated herein and in the City's accompanying Memorandum, Defendants respectfully request that this Court grant Defendants' Motion to Dismiss/Motion for Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' claims and dismiss Plaintiffs' claims or, alternatively, enter a take-nothing judgment in the City's favor, and award Houston such fees, costs, or other relief as to which the Court finds it entitled.

Respectfully submitted,

ARTURO G. MICHEL City Attorney

SUZANNE R. CHAUVIN Chief, General Litigation Section

By: /s/ Suzanne R. Chauvin

Suzanne R. Chauvin
Senior Assistant City Attorney
Southern District Bar No. 14512
Texas State Bar No. 04160600
City of Houston Legal Department
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-368
900 Bagby, 4th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002
Telephone: 832.393.6219
Fax: 832.393.6259
suzanne.chauvin@houstontx.gov

Attorney in Charge

Of Counsel:

Collyn A. Peddie Senior Assistant City Attorney Southern District Bar No. 843 Texas State Bar No.: 15707300 832.393.6463 - Telephone collyn.peddie@houstontx.gov

Attorneys for Defendants City of Houston And Anna Russell, in her official capacity as Secretary for the City of Houston

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on March 18, 2021, a copy of the foregoing City's Motion to Dismiss or, Alternatively, Motion for Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' Claims was served electronically on the CM/ECF system which will automatically serve an electronic notice on the following counsel of record for Plaintiffs:

Jerad Najvar
Austin M.B. Whatley
NAVJAR LAW FIRM, PLLC
2180 North Loop West, Suite 255
Houston, TX 77018
jerad@najvarlaw.com
austin@najvarlaw.com

IMPG ADVOCATES, INC. Paul A. Rossi 316 Hill Street Mountville, PA 17554 Paul-Rossi@comcast.net

/s/ Suzanne R. Chauvin

Suzanne R. Chauvin